BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENT COURT I MUA I TE KOOTI TAIAO O AOTEAROA

IN THE MATTER

of the Resource Management Act 1991

AND

of appeals under clause 14 of the First

Schedule of the Act

BETWEEN

TRANSPOWER NEW ZEALAND LIMITED

(ENV-2018-CHC-26)

... (continued on last page)

Appellants

AND

SOUTHLAND REGIONAL COUNCIL

Respondent

MINUTE OF THE ENVIRONMENT COURT (20 March 2019)

Introduction

- [1] I have been referred to the memorandum of counsel for the Southland Regional Council dated 18 March 2019.
- [2] The court directed in its Minute dated 14 March 2019¹ for the Council to report on the topics for expert conferencing, the proposed sequencing and the availability of the experts for conferencing on the dates indicated.
- [3] Counsel for the Council seeks the following:
 - (a) an amendment to the direction set out in paragraphs [4] and [9] of the court's Minute, to report on topics for conferencing and proposed sequencing of expert conferencing, on Wednesday 27 March 2019, once all of the evidence-in-chief has been circulated;



¹ Minute dated 14 March 2019 at [4] and [9].

- (b) confirmation as to whether Environment Commissioners are also available to conference in the week commencing 8 April 2019; and
- (c) confirmation of the proposed timetable in paragraph [8] of the court's Minute dated 14 March 2019, subject to the deletion of the requirement to file an agreed statement of facts five (5) working days before the first conference.
- [4] As the proposed timetable extends the filing date for evidence-in-chief to Friday 22 March 2019, I will extend the time for filing the memorandum as sought by the Council. This will provide the parties more time to review the evidence before filing a memorandum addressing the details for expert conferencing.
- [5] Given the extension, it is now impractical for the experts to meet in the weeks commencing 25 March or 1 April.
- [6] Parties are advised that Environment Commissioners are available for conferencing from **Tuesday 9 April to Thursday 18 April 2019**. Subject to the memorandum to be filed reporting the topics and sequencing, if the parties find there is a need for more time to complete conferencing, Environment Commissioner Jim Hodges is available in the week of **29 April 2019** (subject to the expert conferencing set down for that week on an unrelated appeal by Wilkins Farming Co).
- [7] I confirm that the direction requiring an agreed statement of facts be filed five working days before the start of a conference is cancelled.
- [8] In response to the above, the proposed timetable for the exchange of evidence and the facilitation of conferencing² will be amended to provisionally allow more time for consideration of evidence and expert conferencing.
- [9] Finally, an issue before the court concerns whether evidence-in-chief on behalf of Southland Fish and Game Council ('Fish and Game') is entirely within the scope of its appeal and/or are properly for the Topic B hearing rather than Topic A. This concerns aspects of the evidence of Dr Death and Mr Farrell. In its 13 March 2019 memorandum, the Regional Council seeks related directions noting the potential procedural consequences to parities with relevant interests. The court has directed Fish and Game to respond by today.



² Minute dated 14 March 2019 [8].

[10] As matters stand, the court is to resolve whether the Council's application requires a determination. Hence, relevant parties in conferencing should note that, any related conferencing outcomes are provisional upon any directions the court may make as to the admissibility of the relevant evidence.

Directions

Evidence timetable directions

[11] I direct:

- evidence-in-chief for the parties opposing the appellants is to be filed and served by Friday 22 March 2019;
- (b) expert witness conferencing is to take place between 9 April and 18 April 2019 (with additional time available for continuation in the week commencing 29 April 2019 if required);
- (c) joint expert witness statements are to be signed at the end of each conference unless otherwise agreed by the Commissioner and filed by Friday 3 May 2019;
- (d) rebuttal evidence for the appellants to be filed and served by Wednesday8 May 2019;
- (e) rebuttal evidence for the section 274 parties is to be filed and served by Wednesday 15 May 2019;
- (f) the Council is to file six (6) tabbed, indexed and paginated hard copies of all evidence (including exhibits) with the court by **Friday 17 May 2019**; ³
- (g) rebuttal evidence for the Council is to be filed and served by Wednesday22 May 2019 and six (6) hardcopies lodged with the court.

Other directions

(h) by Wednesday 27 March 2019 the Council is to file a memorandum addressing the details required for expert conferencing to be set down as previously directed in paragraph [4] of the Minute dated 14 March 2019, including:



³ That is, the folders will be filed without final rebuttal evidence.

- (i) the number of persons anticipated to attend each conference;
- (ii) the **sequencing** of conferences;
- (iii) the availability of experts for conferencing on the dates indicated;
- (iv) the estimated time required for conferencing;
- (v) facilities required; and
- (vi) the most suitable location for conferencing.

[12] Leave is reserved for the parties to apply for further directions (including as may arise in response to the court's determination of the Council's 13 March 2019 application for directions as to matters concerning Fish and Game's Topic 1 evidence).

J E Borthwick
Environment Judge

Issued: 2 0 MAR 2019

List of appellants

| ENV-2018-CHC-27 ENV-2018-CHC-28 ENV-2018-CHC-29 ENV-2018-CHC-30 ENV-2018-CHC-31 | Fonterra Co-Operative Group Ltd Horticulture New Zealand Aratiatia Livestock Limited Wilkins Farming Co Gore District Council, Southland District Council and Invercargill City Council |
|---|---|
| ENV-2018-CHC-32 | DairyNZ Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-33 | H W Richardson Group Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-34 & 35 | Beef + Lamb New Zealand |
| ENV-2018-CHC-36 | Director-General of Conservation |
| ENV-2018-CHC-37 | Southland Fish & Game Council |
| ENV-2018-CHC-38 | Meridian Energy Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-39 | Alliance Group Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-40 | Federated Farmers of New Zealand |
| ENV-2018-CHC-41 | Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga |
| ENV-2018-CHC-42 | Stoney Creek Station Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-43 | The Terraces Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-44 | Campbell's Block Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-45 | Robert Grant |
| ENV-2018-CHC-46 | Southwood Export Limited, Southland Plantation Forest Company of NZ, Southwood Export Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-47 | Te Rūnanga o Ngāi Tahu, Hokonui Rūnaka, Waihopai Rūnaka, Te Rūnanga o Awarua & Te Rūnanga o Oraka Aparima |
| ENV-2018-CHC-48 | Peter Chartres |
| ENV-2018-CHC-49 | Rayonier New Zealand Limited |
| ENV-2018-CHC-50 | Royal Forest and Bird Protection Society of NZ Inc |
| | |

